DEBATING THE PAST

The essay on pages 58 and 59 of the textbook discusses how historians have interpreted “Native Americans and the ‘Middle Ground.’” Teachers may have their students read the essay and respond to the questions on page 59. Student responses might include the following.

1. Identify three camps of historical views regarding the relationship between Native Americans and the European settlers. Name a historian representative of each view, and provide one piece of historical evidence that supports the view.

   One “camp” would be 19th century historians like Francis Parkman who argued that the American Indians were uncivilized, sometimes brutal, sometimes peaceful, who were an obstacle to European settlement. An example would be wars such as the Pequot War or King Philip’s War in which the English settlers defeated the Indians and drove many out of the area. A second perspective suggests that American Indians and Europeans combined their characteristics to create aspects of a blended American culture. James Merrill is an example of this view. The treaties made between American Indians and Europeans and their trade with each other would support this argument.

   A third view represented by Joyce Chaplin suggested that the views Europeans had of the American Indians changed over time. At first, the Indians were seen as “noble,” but, after many Indians died from European diseases or fought against the Europeans, their image changed to one of inferior to the European whites. An example would be the ravages of small pox on the Indian population or King Philip’s War and the loss suffered by an “inferior” enemy, as the English came to believe.

2. Offer a circumstance or factor surrounding one or more of these historians, which might have influenced the historian’s perspective.

   Francis Parkman in the late 19th century wrote at a time when Indian wars were still going on. The Indians were still seen as an obstacle to settlement in the Great Plains by Americans or as “uncivilized” people who needed to be educated and assimilated [Dawes Act]. Later historians were influenced by more progressive ideas of Indians as people in light of the Progressive movement of the early 20th century or the Civil Rights movement of the middle to late 20th century.

3. If you were writing a history of European settlement in North America, name an event which you would consider significant, such that it is a turning point in the relationships between Native Americans and European settlers. Explain.

   This question could lead to good class discussions. Students could come up with a variety of answers.

MULTIPLE CHOICE

1. C
2. C

SHORT ANSWER Use your knowledge of U.S. history to answer questions 3–5.
3. Answer a, b, and c.

a) Briefly explain ONE example of conflict between Native peoples and colonists in the 17th century.

b) Briefly explain a SECOND example of conflict between Native peoples and colonists in the 17th century.

c) Briefly explain ONE example of intra-group conflict among colonists in the 17th century.

SCORING NOTES
A/B) Explanations of one example of conflict between Natives and colonists may include the following.

- The clashes in the early 1600s between the Powhatan Indians and the settlers of Jamestown over territory and various affronts led to years of turmoil and near collapse of the colony before the final suppression of the Natives.
- The Pequot War in Connecticut in the 1630s was sparked by conflict over land and trade competition. The colonists, aided by rival tribes, nearly wiped out the Pequot tribe amid brutal acts of war.
- King Philip’s War was the most dangerous instance of resistance to the New England colonists. King Philip (Metacomet) led a well organized coalition of tribes in opposition to further encroachments by English settlers and customs. The conflict took a significant toll upon the settlers and their economy but Metacomet and his Wampanoag Indians were overcome by the English and their native allies.

C) Explanations of one example of intra-group conflict among colonists may include the following.

- The colony of Maryland was torn between factions supporting the Catholic minority, supported by the Claverts the colonial proprietors, and the Protestant majority. The Protestant seeking to ensure Protestant say in government and the Catholic minority seeking to guarantee their religious freedoms and political rights.
- John Coode’s rebellion in 1689 successfully removed the possibility of Catholic equality in Maryland and established Protestant dominance there.
- Bacon’s Rebellion was the most significant internal conflict of the early colonies. It pitted the people of the “back-country” of Virginia against the ruling elite of the colony with him they differed on policies of Indian relations and political representation. The turmoil showed the need for continued territorial expansion and the potential for social turmoil entailed in continued immigrating by landless indentured servants.
- Once the English seized control of New Amsterdam, there would be persistent tension and political conflict between the English and traditional Dutch land owners of the region.

4. Answer a, b, and c.

a) Briefly explain ONE example of continuing contact between the Native Americans and European colonists in the 17th century.
b) Briefly explain ONE example of how continuing contact between Native Americans and European colonists in the 17th century brought about a cultural or demographic change in one group or the other.

c) Briefly explain ONE example of differences in how the various European nation colonizers reacted to intensified conflicts with Native Americans.

SCORING NOTES
A) Explanations of one example of continuing contact between the Native Americans and European colonists may include the following.

- Native Americans continued to serve as an essential source of aid and knowledge for the settlers as illustrated by the interactions of the Puritans with Squanto and others, who provided aid on how to farm the local produce and hunt the available game.
- Missionary activity persisted as an important point of contact between the natives and all of the various European colonies. The work of missionaries was essential to the spread of European culture and mores to the natives.
- The most important and pervasive point of contact continued to be through trade. In many ways, the trade with native groups was essential to the survival and economic advancement of the colonies in all regions of North America. Natives provided many of the raw materials (furs etc…) for export by colonists as well as a market for manufactured goods brought in to the colonies from Europe.

B) Explanations of one example of how continuing contact between the Native Americans and European colonists brought about cultural or demographic change may include the following.

- Continuing contact with colonists brought displacement and death to the majority of natives in the regions of colonization. The continued spread of disease (such as smallpox) and persistent conflict (as illustrated by the Pequot War and King Philip’s War) depleted the resources and population of the natives to the point of being unable to resist the colonists further.
- Continuing contact with natives led to conflict, some of which threatened to exterminate the colonial settlements (such as seen in the early years of Jamestown and during King Philip’s War), but more importantly it provided the colonists with further opportunities for trade and exploitation.

C) Explanations of differences in how the various European nation colonizers reacted to intensified conflicts with Native Americans may include the following.

- Unlike early policies focused upon exterminating opposition native populations, the Spanish shifted toward policies of conciliation as illustrated by their dealing with the Pueblo uprising. Some increased liberties and say for natives allowed the Spanish to maintain control with their relative small population of Spanish colonists.
- English settlers tended toward continued warfare with the natives as they continued to push the boundaries of their settlements while displacing Indians from their traditional lands, as seen in both Virginia and New England.
5. Answer a, b, and c.

a) Briefly explain ONE example of diverse patterns of colonization in America among the European nations in the 17th century.

b) Briefly explain a SECOND example of diverse patterns of colonization in America among the European nations in the 17th century.

c) Briefly explain ONE example of differences in regional development among the British colonies.

**SCORING NOTES**

A/B) Explanations of one example of diverse patterns of colonization in America may include the following.

- The English tended toward the plantation model of settlement. Seeking to establish distinct, separate societies within the Americas.
- The Spanish maintained smaller colonial populations than the English and tended to subjugate rather than expel the native populations. Additionally, the Spanish later tended to attempt to cultivate trade relations with the native tribes.
- The French and Dutch each groomed smaller, less threatening colonial populations and as a result cultivated successful trade relations with native tribes that aided them economically without the same degree of involvement in internal conflicts.

C) Explanations of one example of differences in regional development among British colonies may include the following.

- The English Caribbean and Southern colonies became dependent upon forced, slave labor to produce labor-intensive cash crops for market with only minor white populations to oversee the production, particularly in the Caribbean.
- The northern English colonies in New England and the mid-Atlantic tended to support more extensive self-sufficient settlements.
- The religious motives behind the founding of the several of the New England colonies, as well as Pennsylvania and Maryland produced distinctive societies and personalities for each of those regions.

**LONG ESSAY** Develop a thoughtful and thorough historical argument that answers the question below. Begin your essay with a thesis statement and support it with relevant historical evidence.

6. Some historians have argued that economic concerns were largely responsible for the differences in regional social and political development of the British colonies in the Americas. Support, modify, or refute this interpretation, providing specific evidence to justify your answer.
SCORING NOTES

Thesis: Possible thesis statements supporting, modifying, or refuting the interpretation may include the following.

- The differing economic potentials of various regions dictated the arrival of differing populations to each region and thus dictated the manner of society that would develop in that region.
- Religion played a more important role in the distinct development of the various English colonies than simple economics.
- A balance of religion and economics determined the social and political development of the various English colonies.
- The development of colonies was far too complex to be narrowed to an over-riding influence of just economics but must include religion, ethnicity, climate and a host of other variables.

Support for argument: Possible evidence that could be used for an argument stressing the role of economics in the development of English colonies includes the following.

- The relatively rapid development of colonies in Virginia and the Caribbean was spurred by the economic potential of those locations.
- The suitability of the Southern and Caribbean colonies producing cash crops led to the development of first indentured labor and later slave labor to provide the workforce needed for labor intensive cash crops such as sugar, rice, and tobacco.
- The lack of suitability of New England colonies for cash crops led to an increased prevalence of smaller subsistence farms and the development of shipping and eventually manufacture as a means to support the region, while exporting natural resources (timber, furs etc…) rather than produce.

Support for argument: Possible evidence that could be used for an argument stressing the role of religion in the development of English colonies includes the following.

- The origins of the first New England settlers as Puritan dissenters guaranteed that there would be a religious character to the development of the region.
- The founding of Maryland under the auspices of Catholic proprietors led to definitive turmoil between the Catholics and the Protestant settlers that were needed to provide ample populace for the success of the colony. The tensions between these groups would leave a clear impression upon the politics of the colony.
- Pennsylvania was created precisely to provide a religious refuge from persecution, with economic motivations seemingly secondary to the religious goals.

Application of Historical Thinking Skills

Essays earn points by using the evidence offered in support of their argument to identify and illustrate continuity and change over time. Examples include, but are not limited to, the following.

- The origins of multiple colonies were religious, but time showed the over-riding importance of economics as each colony became more integrated into the commerce of the Empire and more secular over time.
- The distinct characteristics of the various colonies continued throughout the Revolutionary era, the formation of the Republic, and in many ways until the present day.

Synthesis

Essays can earn the point for synthesis by crafting a persuasive and coherent essay. This can be accomplished by providing a conclusion that extends or modifies the analysis in the essay or by
connecting to another historical period or context. Examples could include, but are not limited to, the following.

- Explaining how the differing characteristics of the different colonies’ founding and growth shaped their development can be reflected in their reactions to the various crises of the later Republic.
- Comparison of the roles of economics as opposed to religion in later periods, such as expansion of corporations, through discussion of movements such as the Social Gospel can illuminate the impetus of economics in society and the religious reaction to the impact of economic-driven decisions.